

Completions and Reconstructions of Musical Works
Part 5: Scandinavia and Eastern Europe; Germany and Second Viennese School; Spain; England;
United States

by Stephen Barber

Scandinavia and Eastern Europe

Grieg's string quartet in G minor is well known. He began a companion, in F major, but completed just the first two movements, leaving only sketches for the rest. Most recordings offering the second quartet include only these two movements. This is also true of Alf Årdal's arrangements for string orchestra under Stephan Barratt-Due (Naxos). After Grieg's death, his friend the composer Julius Röntgen completed the quartet from the sketches. This completion was long neglected until the Raphael Quartet made the first recording (Olympia). Another, much shorter, completion is by Levon Chilingirian, leader of his quartet (Hyperion).

Sibelius's original music for *Karelia* consisted of eleven movements, of which the composer drew on three for the well-known suite. Sibelius destroyed the original score, but it was mostly reconstructed from the surviving parts by Kalevi Kuosa. The missing parts, which were the lower string lines, have been supplied in two different reconstructions: by Kalevi Aho, recorded by Osmo Vänska (BIS-CD 915) and by Jouni Kaipainen, recorded by Tuomas Ollila (Ondine). Aho also orchestrated Sibelius's 1897 *Cantata for a university graduation ceremony* from the surviving vocal score, recorded among the choral works in the BIS complete Sibelius edition.

The original version of Sibelius's violin concerto is even more demanding than the revised one. It was unknown until 1991 when the estate permitted a performance and recording by Leonidas Kavakos (BIS). Similarly, the original version of the fifth symphony has been reconstructed from the parts and recorded by Osmo Vänska, together with the first version of *En Saga* (BIS).

But the great mystery with Sibelius is, of course, the eighth symphony. Sibelius said he had completed it 'several times,' but was not satisfied with it and burned his drafts. More recently, sketches were found which might have been for it, and it is also possible he may have reused some of the material in some of the late works he did publish. You can hear a version of the sketches [here](#). Although completing the symphony has been suggested, it is doubtful whether enough material survives to do so.

Aarre Merikanto was at his best in his modernist period, but it was also his least successful. He suffered from depression, during which he destroyed some scores and mutilated others, tearing out odd pages. Two mutilated scores have been reconstructed by Paavo Heininen, who had been his pupil. These are Merikanto's boldest work, the *Symphonic Study*, recorded, along with the composer's other most adventurous works, in a valuable disc by Leif Segerstam (Finlandia), and the String Sextet, which has not yet been recorded. The Nonet had to be reconstructed from the parts and has been recorded by Ulf Söderblom (Ondine). The composer Paavo Heininen has also reimagined the third violin concerto, which Merikanto destroyed completely, under the title *Tuuminki* (A Notion), but this has also not as yet been recorded.

Uuno Klami did not complete his projected ballet *Pyörteitä* (*Whirls*). He split the music he had written for the second act into two suites, which were recorded by Osmo Vänska (BIS CD 656). Later, piano scores of the first two acts were found. Kalevi Aho undertook the orchestration of the first act, which was recorded separately by Vänska (BIS CD 696). The third act was missing; Aho wrote music for that

too, and when a projected performance did not materialize, recast it as his *Symphonic Dances*, also recorded by Vännska (BIS CD 1336). You will need all three discs to assemble a complete recording of the ballet, which should be seen as a joint work by both composers. Maybe BIS would be prepared to join them up together in one set.

Kalevi Aho also completed the orchestration of the last work of Einojuhani Rautavaara, his *Two Serenades for violin and orchestra*. We must hope for a recording.

Janáček was dissatisfied with his piano sonata *1. X. 1905*. He took the third movement, a funeral march, from the pianist at the rehearsal and burned it on the spot. He later threw the manuscript of the surviving first two movements into the Vltava river. Fortunately, the pianist Ludmila Tučková, who had played them, had made a copy of them. She revealed it many years later, and Janáček permitted publication. This work is frequently recorded. No one has tried to reconstruct the lost finale. There is an orchestration of the two surviving movements by Reinbert de Leeuw (Alpha) and another by Theo Verbey, which you can hear [here](#).

Janáček wrote *The Diary of One who Disappeared* as a cantata for tenor, alto, female voices and piano. However, he also envisaged a stage version, and the score was orchestrated after his death by Ota Zitek and Vaclav Sedláček for this purpose. This has been recorded by Claudio Abbado (DG). There is also a chamber ensemble version by Reinbert de Leeuw (Etcetera).

Many of Janáček's works were first published in versions which did not reflect his wishes, and there has been a long process of cleaning up the scores. Charles Mackerras played a key role in this. In the case of the *Glagolitic Mass* the composer had to simplify some of the writing before the premiere, and further revisions were made before the final version, which became standard. Paul Wingfield reconstructed the original version, whose first recording was by Charles Mackerras (Chandos – Mackerras also recorded the standard version on Supraphon). Tomáš Netopil (Supraphon) reconstructs the 1927 first performance version. There is a review and discussion of the differences [here](#).

Martinů wrote his last opera, *The Greek Passion*, in English, with a view to a production at Covent Garden. However, this London version of 1957 was rejected and he revised and largely rewrote it. This revised version was first produced posthumously, in 1961 in Zürich. Many years later the London version was reconstructed by Aleš Březina in a production which did later come to Covent Garden. Both versions continue in circulation. Mackerras performed both versions but recorded only the Zürich one (Supraphon). The London version has been recorded by Ulf Schirmer (Koch Schwann) and (slightly cut) by Dirk Kaftan (Oehms).

Bartók's *Miraculous Mandarin*, his boldest score, is best-known from the Suite, which has about two thirds of the music, but the complete ballet is far preferable, though the requirement of a chorus means it is less often performed. It turns out that about thirty bars had been cut from the previously published score of the ballet version. These were restored by the composer's son Peter Bartók with Nelson Dellamaggiore from manuscript sources and the piano four hands version, with the revised score published in 2000. The first recording to include the extra passage was by David Robertson (Harmonia Mundi) and there is another by Marin Alsop (Naxos).

Bartók left two works unfinished at his death. In the case of the Piano Concerto No. 3 it was only the orchestration of the last seventeen bars which was lacking. This was supplied by Tibor Serly, and the work has joined the repertoire with many recordings, personal favourites being Géza Anda (DG) and

Zoltán Kocsis (Philips). The Viola Concerto is a good deal more problematic. Although Bartók had claimed it was nearly complete, in fact he had left only sketches. Again Tibor Serly came to the rescue, but the task this time was much more difficult and his version has been twice revised, by Bartók's son Peter with Nelson Dellamaggiore, who slightly enlarged the orchestra, and again by Csaba Erdélyi. Recordings should say which version they are using, which is usually Serly. The first recording of the Erdelyi version was by himself with Marc Taddei conducting (Concordance). The one by Hong-Mei Xiao conducted by János Kovács (Naxos) contains both the Tibor Serly and the Peter Bartók versions. There is also a transcription for the work for cello, which has been recorded by János Starker (RCA) and Raphael Wallfisch (Nimbus). Although violists have seized on the work as a major addition to their meagre concerto repertoire, I have to say that I have not yet been convinced by any version.

Enescu was a perfectionist and this, together with his life as a travelling virtuoso, meant that he started but did not complete a number of works. Some of these were well advanced. Dates are often uncertain and opus numbers unhelpful. A number of composers and scholars, particularly Pascal Bentoiu, have retrieved several of them and put them into performable shape. Of the Symphony No. 4 Enescu left a complete sketch, but orchestrated only the first and part of the second of the three movements. The remainder was orchestrated by Bentoiu and has been recorded by Peter Ruzicka (CPO777 926). Enescu also left the Symphony No. 5 as a sketch and orchestrated only part of the first of the four movements. Bentoiu orchestrated the remainder and Ruzicka recorded it (CPO 777 823), coupled with the symphonic poem *Isis*, of which Enescu also left only a sketch, which Bentoiu orchestrated. These symphonies are really impressive. Enescu completed one movement and started another of the *Suite chatelaine*. These were put into performable shape and recorded by Remus Georgescu (Marco Polo). Enescu also planned a trilogy of symphonic poems to be called *Voix de la nature*, but wrote only part of the first part and all of the third. The first, *Nuages d'Automne sur les forêts* is coupled by Ruzicka with the fourth symphony. The third is *Vox maris*, which, contrary to some accounts, he did complete and is one of his most powerful orchestral works; it has been recorded by Ion Baci (Marco Polo) and Cristian Mandeal (Arte Nova), who also has with it another recording of *Nuages d'Automne sur les forêts* under the overall title *Voix de la nature*.

Among concertante works the *Caprice roumain* was completed by Cornel Țăranu and recorded by Sherban Lupu (Electrocord).

Enescu's Piano Trio in A minor was only discovered after his death. It was edited by Hilda Jerea and then again by Bentoiu. This has been recorded several times, for example by Trio Brancusi (Zigzag) and Trio Enescu (Genuin). The version by the Schubert Quartet (Chandos) is based on a fresh study of the manuscript and differs somewhat from Bentoiu.

Enescu wrote a good deal of piano music. Raluca Stirbat (Hänssler) includes a number of early works as well as the published ones. However, no recording can include the second of the three piano sonatas Enescu composed, since, although he said he had it in his head and even gave it the number Op. 24 No. 2, he never wrote it down.

Enescu left a piano score of his cantata *Strigoli* (Ghosts) and an incomplete short score with indications of orchestration. This was edited by Cornel Țăranu and orchestrated by the composer Sabin Păuța and has been recorded by Gabriel Bebeșelea (Capriccio).

Given the problematic nature of so many Enescu works, I perhaps need to say that he did complete his masterpiece, the opera *Oedipe*, which was performed in his lifetime and has been recorded several

times, notably by Lawrence Foster (EMI) and Michael Gielen (Naxos). It is also possible that other currently lost works may turn up and be put into performable shape.

Germany and Second Viennese School

Richard Strauss first envisaged the string work which became *Metamorphosen* as a work for eleven strings, then for a septet (string sextet plus a double bass). He later expanded it to a work for twentythree strings, in which form it has become well known. The draft of the septet version turned up in 1990 and was turned into a performing edition by Rudolf Leopold in 1991. There is a recording by the Nash Ensemble (Hyperion). This is very convincing; it deserves hearing alongside the sextet version of Schoenberg's *Verklärte Nacht*, with which *Metamorphosen* is often coupled, though in that case the chamber version is the original and the string orchestra version the composer's own later transcription. There is also a piano solo version, made by Gustave Samazeuilh and approved by the composer, which has only recently come to light; it has not yet been recorded.

The *Four Last Songs* were put together and given that title after Strauss's death by Ernest Roth, his friend and publisher. No one is going to change the grouping now, but it is worth noting that, at around the same time that he wrote these songs, Strauss made an orchestral version of his early song *Ruhe, meine Seele* Op. 27 No. 1, and it could have been added to the set before *Im Abendrot*, with which it has affinities. Felicity Lott included it, with the *Four Last Songs* and others in her first disc of Strauss's orchestral songs (Chandos 9054).

As with Liszt, it is hard to draw a firm line between Busoni's transcriptions and arrangements and his own compositions. His *Fantasia after J. S. Bach* draws on three works by Bach for a work of his own. Similarly, his fifth sonatina, the *Sonatina brevis in signo Joannis Sebastiani Magni*, uses material from Bach's *Fantasia and Fugue* BWV 905. There are numerous recordings of both of these, notably by Pöntinen (CPO) and Hamelin (Hyperion). The *Fantasia, Adagio e contains* C Minor Fantasia BWV 906, the Adagio BWV 968 (from the C Major Sonata for unaccompanied violin) and ends with Busoni's completion of the fragmentary C Minor Fugue BWV 906a. This and various other transcriptions and arrangements are in Holger Groschopp's set (Capriccio). The largest work of this kind is the *Fantasia Contrappuntistica*, which began as a completion of *Contrapunctus 14*, the final fugue from the Bach's *Art of Fugue*, already discussed above. Busoni adopted Bernard Ziehn's combination of its three themes with the motto theme of the whole work but added a great of new material, some of it taken from other parts of the *Art of Fugue* and some of it his own. There are four versions of this work in all. The first, called *Grosse Fuge*, has been recorded by Holger Groschopp (Capriccio); the second, called *Fantasia Contrappuntistica* and subtitled *edizione definitiva* (but it was not to prove so) by numerous pianists such as Hamish Milne (Hyperion) but few, who include John Ogdon (Altarus) and Carlo Grante (Music and Arts), include the important passage Busoni relegated to an Appendix; the third the *Fantasia Contrappuntistica edizione minore* by Wolf Harden in volume 11 of his complete Busoni series (Naxos 8.573982); and the fourth, a version for two pianos, by Alan Schiller and John Humphreys (Naxos) and by Andras Schiff and Peter Serkin (ECM). These versions all differ and the pianist, composer and Busoni scholar Larry Sitsky proposed and performed a fifth, combining the best of all of them (details in his book on Busoni's piano music). However, this has not yet been recorded – it deserves to be. Busoni also wanted to orchestrate the work, but did not live to do so; there are orchestral versions by Sitsky, Antony Beaumont, Ira Levin and others, yet to be recorded.

Busoni's 'concert interpretation' of Schoenberg's piano piece Op. 11 No. 2 is in effect his idea of how Schoenberg should have composed it, so as it were a reconstruction after the event. Schoenberg was

horrified. It has been recorded by Liska on a disc of Schoenberg arrangements (Capriccio) and by Holger Groschopp (Capriccio).

Busoni's last and greatest work, the opera *Doktor Faust*, he left unfinished, with both the scene in which Helen of Troy dances and the closing scene uncomposed. For many years, a stop-gap completion by Philipp Jarnach was used. Leitner's recording (DG) has this but is cut. However, in the 1980s the conductor and musicologist Antony Beaumont found Busoni's plans for the missing scenes, which drew on works he had already composed, and so was able to complete them. The resulting completed version has had several stage productions. Kent Nagano (Erato) is uncut and provides both the Jarnach and the Beaumont completions. Tomáš Netopil (Oehms) provides neither. More recently Larry Sitsky has also made a completion but this has yet to be recorded.

Schoenberg tended to be a fast worker, and, if he was interrupted while working on a composition, was often unable to pick up the threads to finish it. Among his many unfinished works and fragments are *Ein Stelldichein*, a work for chamber ensemble, which might have been a companion to *Verklärte Nacht*. It was supplemented and completed by Friedrich Cerha and recorded by Michael Lessky (Gramola). Similarly the third of his *Three Pieces for Chamber Orchestra* was left unfinished, as was his late *Modern Psalm*; both were recorded by Pierre Boulez (Sony). He was, however, able to complete his Second Chamber Symphony many years after he had started it. The numerous recordings include the Orpheus Chamber Orchestra (DG) and John Mauceri (Decca).

Despite his objections to what Busoni had done to his piano piece, Schoenberg was not averse to rehandling works by other composers. As well as his orchestrations of Bach and Brahms, he also revised two baroque works in ways which go beyond reconstruction to actual recomposition. First there was a Cello Concerto, after one by Matthias Georg Monn, and then a String Quartet Concerto, after Handel's Concerto Grosso in B flat Op. 6 No. 7. There is a convenient coupling of both of them from Jun Märkl (MDR Klassik).

Two large and important works were left unfinished. Work on the large-scale choral and orchestral work *Die Jakobsleiter* was interrupted by military service and never resumed. Schoenberg left a short score of the first part and the symphonic interlude which would have preceded the uncomposed second part. Together these last about three quarters of an hour. After the composer's death Winfried Zillig orchestrated the draft, and revealed the work as one of great power and beauty. It has been several times recorded, notably by Pierre Boulez (Sony), Michael Gielen (Hänssler) and Kent Nagano (Harmonia Mundi).

Of Schoenberg's last opera, *Moses and Aron*, he left us the first two acts fully completed and scored. At the end of the second act Moses laments his inability to convey his vision of God effectively because of his lack of eloquence. Of the short third act Schoenberg left only the libretto. In this last act Moses confronts Aron, who falls dead. Most people, including myself, have found the two completed acts entirely satisfying in themselves, contrary to my usual approach in this article. There are numerous recordings, notably Michael Gielen (Philips) and Pierre Boulez (Sony and DG). Zoltán Kocsis made a musical setting of the third act. This has not yet been commercially recorded but you can hear it [here](#). (Alternatively, listen to Alexander Goehr's impressive cantata, *The Death of Moses*, close in feeling to Schoenberg (Unicorn-Kanchana).)

Berg gave a copy of the score of his second string quartet, the *Lyric Suite*, to his secret love, Hanna Fuchs-Robettin. In 1977 the composer and Berg scholar George Perle examined it and found that it contained a secret programme which included a vocal line for the finale, written in shorthand. He

reconstructed this and argued that Berg really intended it to be performed. (Schoenberg had previously included a voice in his own second string quartet.) This is debatable, but some recordings now include it. The first to do so was the Kronos Quartet (Nonesuch) and they have been followed by the Quatuor Diotima (Naïve) and the Petersen Quartet (Phoenix). The Emerson quartet (Decca) include both the published and the reconstructed versions, which is perhaps the best arrangement.

Berg completed the short score of his opera *Lulu* but broke off the orchestration in the third act to write his violin concerto and died before returning to the opera. (He had already orchestrated the closing scene for his *Lulu-Suite*.) His widow Helene approached several composers to complete the orchestration but all refused. She then turned against the work and tried to suppress knowledge of the third act. For many years the work was performed as a torso, and early recordings were of this version. Eventually Berg's publishers commissioned Friedrich Cerha to complete the orchestration, but this was withheld until after Helene Berg's death. The first performance of the completed version was in 1979 under Pierre Boulez, who made the first recording (DG). It is now frequently performed and recorded.

Webern left no incomplete works but a good deal of juvenilia which preceded his *Passacaglia*, his official Op. 1. Pierre Boulez included them, not in his first Webern set (Sony), which contains only the published works, but in his second (DG). The best known of these are the orchestral tone poem *Im Sommerwind* and the string quartet movement *Langsamer Satz*. These have each had several other recordings, for example Riccardo Chailly (Decca) and Giuseppe Sinopoli (Warner) for the tone poem, and the Schoenberg Quartet (Chandos) and the Quatuor Diotima (Naïve) for the quartet.

Zemlinsky had an early success with the tone-poem *Die Seejungfrau* but later effectively withdrew it, giving the score of the first movement to a friend, while that for the second and third movements went with him to the USA. They were not reunited until 1984. The first recording was by Riccardo Chailly (Decca). That by John Storgårds (Ondine) includes an extra passage cut by the composer and recovered by Antony Beaumont, whose own recording (Chandos) is of the standard version.

Zemlinsky wrote a number of orchestral songs, but of a projected cycle drafted in 1900-1 only two songs survive, and these in short score. They were orchestrated by Antony Beaumont for James Conlon's complete set of the orchestral songs (EMI).

His last opera, *Der König Kandaules*, he completed in a rather confused short score but had orchestrated only part of the first act. The remainder was edited and orchestrated by Antony Beaumont and has had several productions. There are recordings by Gerd Albrecht (Capriccio) and Kent Nagano (Andante).

Schreker wrote numerous operas but also for many years planned one that was never to be completed. This was *Memnon*. Instead, he used the materials in *Prelude to a Large Opera*, a very large-scale concert overture (not to be confused with *Prelude to a Drama*, which is the overture to *Die Gezeichneten*), and this has been recorded, for example by James Conlon (EMI), Vassily Sinaisky (Chandos) and Lawrence Renes (BIS).

Korngold wrote film scores as well as concert music, and in the general revival of interest in his work, these have also been recorded. Like most film scores, they need some editorial work. There have been a number of recordings, with several by William T. Stromberg (Naxos) and Rumon Gamba (Chandos) and I shall mention two more: *Between two worlds* (Decca) and *Previn conducts Korngold* (DG).

Hindemith completed his first string quartet in 1915 and listed it as his Opus 2. It was performed once but remained unpublished in his lifetime and was for long thought lost. The six later quartets were therefore assigned numbers 1 to 6 by the publishers. However, the early quartet eventually turned up and, since the composer had given it an opus number, was added to the canon, with the numbering of all the later quartets moved on by one. This has caused confusion. Older cycles, such as that by the Kocian (Praga Digitals) have only the six long-standing ones, while newer ones such as the Juilliard (Wergo) and the Amar (Naxos) have all seven.

Kurt Weill was a *bête noire* of the Nazis. When he fled Germany he had to leave some of his scores behind, and to the end of his life thought they had been lost. What survived was sometimes in considerable disarray and it is taking a long time to produce authoritative scores. The series of Weill recordings on Capriccio is invaluable. Meirion Bowen rescored his early stage work, the children's pantomime *Zaubernacht* from the piano draft and this was recorded (Capriccio). However, Weill's own score then turned up which, of course, replaced it, and has itself now been recorded (CPO). *Royal Palace* was not so fortunate, and had to be reconstructed from the piano score by Gunther Schuller and Noam Sheriff; it has been recorded by Andrew Davis (Capriccio). Fortunately, the scores of *Aufstieg und Fall der Stadt Mahagonny* and *Die Bürgschaft* had been hidden, were recovered and have been recorded, by Jan Latham-König (Capriccio) and Julius Rudel (EMI) respectively. *Mahagonny* has had numerous productions. Weill did not carry out the orchestration of his operetta *Der Kuhhandel* (A kingdom for a cow) and this was done by Lys Symonette; excerpts have been recorded by Jan Latham König (Capriccio) and the complete work by Christoph Eberle (Phoenix Edition DVD). His enormous Biblical pageant *Der Weg der Verheissung* was reconstructed with the help of Noam Sheriff and John Mauceri. There are partial recordings (in English, not the original German), as *The Eternal Road* by Gerard Schwarz (Naxos) and a longer one as *The Road of Promise* by Ted Sperling (Navona Records).

Hanns Eisler did not complete his *Leipzig Symphony*, based on his film scores. This has been done by Thilo Medek and recorded by Bruns (Capriccio).

The Jewish composers imprisoned in the show camp or ghetto of Terezín (Theresienstadt) managed to continue composing, though generally on a small scale. The recovery and performance of some of their works is a story in itself; obviously a good deal of editorial work was needed. Of actual reconstructions I should mention Viktor Ullmann's two symphonies and his overture *Don Quixote tanzt Fandango*, orchestrated by Bernhard Wulff from his piano sonatas Nos. 5 and 7 and a short score (Capriccio). His opera *Der Kaiser von Atlantis* was worked over by several people, with the version with expanded orchestra by Ingo Schultz becoming standard and recorded by Lothar Zagrosek (Decca). The original orchestration is used in the rival version from Alexander Drčar (Studio Matouš). Pavel Haas's unfinished symphony was orchestrated from sketches by Zdeněk Zouhar and has been recorded by Israel Yinon, a great champion of these composers (Koch Schwann). Gideon Klein's *Partita*, arranged from his string trio by Vojtěch Saudek, has been recorded by Christoph Eschenbach (Ondine). You can read more about these composers [here](#).

Spain

Albéniz completed his masterpiece, the piano suite *Iberia*, shortly before his death. An orchestral version was begun by Enrique Fernández Arbós, completed by Carlos Surinach and recorded by Jesús López-Cobos (Telarc). Albéniz left two piano works unfinished. One was *Azulejos*, which was completed by Granados and has been recorded by Alicia de Larrocha (EMI) and Miguel Baselga (BIS); the other was *Navarra*, which was intended for *Iberia* but rejected by the composer. Déodat de Séverac supplied

a short completion, which is what is usually played. There is also one by Pilar Bayona, recorded by Baselga (BIS) and William Bolcom made a fuller one, using Albéniz's own material. This has been recorded by Marc-André Hamelin (Hyperion).

Granados himself left an unfinished violin sonata at his death. This would have been an impressive work. Two movements are complete and there are the beginnings only of two more. As far as I know, no one has yet attempted to complete the work; what there is has been recorded by members of the Trio Rodin (Aevea).

Falla's *El Amor Brujo* was first performed in 1915 as a work for voice and chamber orchestra, but was unsuccessful in this version. The composer revised the work, reducing its length, scoring it for a standard symphony orchestra and leaving only three vocal numbers. This is the standard version, frequently recorded. The original version was reconstructed by Antonio Gallego in 1986 and has been recorded by Josep Pons (Harmonia Mundi), Angel Gil-Ordóñez (Naxos) and J. F. Heisser (Mirare).

In his later years Falla worked on a large scale work, first envisaged as a cantata, then as an opera, with the title *Atlántida*. He never finished it and after his death Ernesto Halffter undertook to complete it, his version being itself several times revised. There is a recording by Edmon Colomer (Auvidis Valois).

England

In his last years Elgar worked on several projects which he did not complete. The most important was the third symphony, for which he left many sketches, some of which were published. The estate decided to commission a completion, and this was undertaken by Anthony Payne, who carefully described his work as 'the sketches for symphony no. 3 elaborated by Anthony Payne.' As with the earlier case of Mahler's tenth symphony, this has been treated as a distinction without a difference, and the resulting work has been well accepted. The first recording was by Andrew Davis (NMCD053), since when there have been several others. There is also, as with Deryck Cooke's work on Mahler, a separate CD in which Payne describes his work (NMCD052), and also a book by him. Payne also completed a sixth *Pomp and Circumstance* march from Elgar's sketches, recorded by Richard Hickox (Chandos) and Tadaaki Otaka (Signum).

Elgar worked on his piano concerto sporadically over many years. He left many sketches and a short score of the slow movement, which was orchestrated by Percy M. Young and recorded by Margaret Fingerhut with Douglas Bostock conducting (Classico CLASS CD 334). Robin Walker realized the sketches to make a complete work, and this has been recorded by David Owen Norris with David Lloyd Jones conducting (Dutton Epoch CDLX7148). The Classico disc also includes the suite Percy Young made from Elgar's sketches for an opera, *The Spanish Lady*.

In recent years a number of early works by Vaughan Williams, which had been suppressed or withdrawn, have been released, some of which have involved completion by other hands. The very early *Fantasy for piano and orchestra* has been recorded by Mark Bebbington with George Vass conducting (Somm). *The Solent, Harnham Down* and *Burley Heath* have been recorded by Paul Daniel (Albion), and the first two by Rumon Gamba (Chandos). Martyn Brabbins has recorded a clutch of unknown Vaughan Williams, realized by contemporary composers, under the title *Discoveries* (Albion). (Albion records is devoted to recording rare and unknown Vaughan Williams.) Otherwise, the conductor Martin Yates and Dutton records have led the way. They have recorded *Heroic Elegy & Triumphal Epilogue, Serenade in A minor* and *Bucolic Suite*, which the composer completed but did not publish. On another Dutton disc is *The Blue Bird*, orchestrated by Yates himself along with all three

Norfolk Rhapsodies. The first has long been familiar, but the second and third were withdrawn and the scores of part of the second and all of the third are missing. Stephen Hogger supplied the missing pages of the second, while David Matthews reconstructed the third from the surviving description of it, retitled as *Norfolk March*.

The *London Symphony* was premiered just before the outbreak of the first World War, and the score was sent to Germany and lost. It was reconstructed from the orchestral parts. It was twice revised, largely by way of cuts, before the first published version of 1920, which was recorded a few times in the days of 78s. It was revised again with further cuts before the final version of 1936. This is the standard version, with many recordings; my favourites are Vernon Handley and Bernard Haitink (both EMI). However, in recent years a recording of 1914 has been made by Richard Hickox (Chandos) and of 1920 by both Martin Yates (Dutton) and Martyn Brabbins (Hyperion). Those who care for the work should hear these.

Yates also orchestrated and recorded the orchestral suite from the opera *Sir John in Love*, titled *Fat Knight*, and made an orchestral version of the brass band overture *Henry V*. Among later works, *Dark Pastoral*, intended as the slow movement of a Cello Concerto, was completed and orchestrated by David Matthews, recorded on another of the Dutton discs.

Vaughan Williams wrote music for eight films, and this has been gathered on a set of three discs under Rumon Gamba (Chandos). However, the most important, that for *Scott of the Antarctic*, is now available in a fuller version from Yates (Dutton). This includes music not only not drawn on for the *Sinfonia Antartica* but also some which was not even used in the film. Vaughan Williams also wrote incidental music for plays, including radio plays. The overture and suite he made of the music for Aristophanes's *The Wasps* are well known, but the complete score has been edited by Igor Kennaway and David Pountney and recorded by Mark Elder (Hallé). Some of his other incidental music has been recovered, such as that for three plays by Euripides by Alan Tongue (Albion) and for Shakespeare's *Richard II*, which was never used, recorded by Yates (Dutton).

Vaughan Williams's intended *magnum opus*, the opera *Pilgrim's Progress*, had a long and complicated gestation. The first part to be completed, *The Shepherds of the Delectable Mountains*, of 1922, recorded by Matthew Best (Hyperion), became the penultimate scene of the opera. In 1943 there was a broadcast using music the composer had drafted for the opera. The original broadcast has been issued (Albion) and an adaptation by Christopher Palmer has been recorded also by Best with the title *The Pilgrim's Progress: A Bunyan Sequence* (Hyperion). Vaughan Williams also drew on some of its themes in his fifth symphony, of 1943, thinking he might never complete the opera. However, it finally appeared in 1951; there are three recordings: Adrian Boult (EMI), Igor Kennaway (RNCM PP1-2 DDD) and Richard Hickox (Chandos).

Both Holst and Bridge planned symphonies which they were not able to complete. Holst left only a *Scherzo*, recorded by Adrian Boult (Lyrita) and Andrew Davis (Chandos) and Bridge only an *Allegro moderato*, which was realized by Colin Matthews and recorded by Nicholas Braithwaite (Lyrita) and Richard Hickox (Chandos).

John Ireland wrote music for a film, *The Overlanders*, which, after his death, was made into a suite by Charles Mackerras. Geoffrey Bush arranged *A Downland Suite* and *Julius Caesar* for orchestra from the original brass band versions. They have both been recorded by Adrian Boult (Lyrita). All three have also been recorded by Martin Yates (Dutton), who uses his new orchestration of *A Downland Suite*. Graham Parlett arranged a number of Ireland works for string orchestra, recorded by David Curtis (Naxos)

As well as his canonical seven symphonies and the unnumbered early symphony *Spring Fire*, Arnold Bax completed an even earlier Symphony in F in piano score, but he never orchestrated it. Martin Yates has orchestrated and recorded this (Dutton). Bax's numbered first symphony originated as a piano sonata in E flat, which came between his second and third numbered sonatas, before he realised it would work better as a symphony, for which he wrote a different slow movement. He never published the sonata, which was forgotten until the 1980s and required a fair amount of editorial work. It has now been recorded three times: by John McCabe (Continuum), Michael Endres as part of a complete Bax sonata cycle (Oehms) and Mark Bebbington (Somm).

Bax composed a number of orchestral songs, some of which have been lost. A group of those which survive have been recorded by Martyn Hill (Chandos); this includes *Glamour*, orchestrated by Rodney Newton from the piano score.

Otherwise, the person who has done most to rescue lost or forgotten Bax works is Graham Parlett. He has orchestrated works such as *On the Seashore*, *Red Autumn*, *Nocturne* (all Chandos) and the *Symphonic Serenade* (Dutton), as well as compiling the standard catalogue of Bax's works. With so much of Bax out of print or unpublished there is a real need for a proper complete edition, though I suppose nothing will happen until he is out of copyright.

Arthur Bliss's score for the film *Things to come* has always been highly regarded. Philip Lane reassembled it from various sources, and it is included, with other Bliss film scores, in Rumon Gamba's film music series (Chandos).

Ernest Moeran's G minor symphony is well-known. He left sketches for a second symphony, which, following a pattern which is now becoming familiar, Martin Yates has used for what he describes as *Sketches for Symphony No. 2 in E flat realised and completed by Martin Yates* (Dutton). This also contains Moeran's *Overture for a Festival*, orchestrated by Yates from the piano score (and also an orchestration of Ireland's piano suite *Sarnia*).

Walton wrote music for over a dozen films, but arranged little of his work in this form into concert suites. Walton himself, Carl Davis and Charles Groves all recorded some of it (all EMI). However, the most comprehensive collection was made after Walton's death by Christopher Palmer and recorded by Neville Marriner in four discs (Chandos). Palmer also arranged a Symphonic Suite from Walton's opera *Troilus and Cressida*. This has been recorded by Bryden Thomson (Chandos) and a new version is due from Mirga Gražinytė-Tyla (DG). Walton eventually abandoned work on his projected third symphony.

Constant Lambert was already suffering from his final illness when trying to complete his last work, the ballet *Tiresias*. He had to enlist the help of a number of fellow composers to carry out the orchestration under his direction. It has been recorded by David Lloyd-Jones (Hyperion).

Tippett withdrew his early works, and mostly they have not yet surfaced. One which has is his pre-war Symphony in B flat, which preceded his official first symphony. This has received its first recording as part of Martyn Brabbins' complete Tippett symphony cycle (Hyperion).

Britten either did not publish or withdrew a number of his early works, which did surface after his death. These include the *Quatre Chansons Françaises*, recorded by Felicity Lott (Collins and Chandos), *Two Portraits*, recorded by Kent Nagano (Warner) and Edward Gardner (Chandos), the *Double Concerto*, recorded by Nagano (Warner) and Ilan Volkov (Hyperion), *Young Apollo*, recorded by Nagano

(Warner) and Volkov (Hyperion) and his first opera, *Paul Bunyan*, recorded by Richard Hickox (Chandos) and Philip Brunelle (Virgin). There is also a composite work assembled by Colin Matthews from sketches made for Benny Goodman and some other works and titled *Movements for a Clarinet Concerto*, which has twice been recorded by Michael Collins (NMC and Chandos).

United States

Charles Ives published few of his works and was a compulsive reviser, so the issue for him is one of editing rather than of reconstruction. An exception to this is his *Universe Symphony*, which he projected and sketched but never completed. There have been two completions. That by Larry Austin uses Ives's ideas but also a good deal of his own material (Centaur). The more recent one by Johnny Reinhardt (Stereo Society) uses only Ives's own material but has a relatively small group of 19 musicians play some 120 lines, with plentiful use of overdubbing. Reinhardt also has written a book about how he set about the task. This is probably the closest we are going to get to Ives's concept.

I should also mention here the orchestration of Ives's *Concord Sonata* by Henry Brant as *A Concord Symphony*, which has been twice recorded, by Dennis Russell Davies (Innova) and Michael Tilson Thomas (SFS Media). I find this very successful.

Carl Ruggles wrote little, but of high quality, recorded complete by Michael Tilson Thomas (Other Minds). He destroyed many of his sketches but a large number remained. After Ruggles's death John Kirkpatrick, also known for his work on Ives, assembled some of these into four piano works and one for violin and piano. They have been recorded by Donald Berman on a disc titled *The Uncovered Ruggles* (New World Records). Ruggles also destroyed the draft of his opera, *The Sunken Bell*, which he had submitted to the Metropolitan opera; Robert Young McMahan was at one time working on a reconstruction but this has not appeared.

Aaron Copland left his last work on his music desk. He gave Bennett Lerner permission to turn it into a short piano piece, titled *Proclamation*, recorded by Leo Smit (Sony) and Ramon Salvatore (Cedille) and he also authorised Philip Ramey to orchestrate it. This has not yet been commercially recorded but you can hear it [here](#).