

Completions and Reconstructions of Musical Works
Part 3: Romantic period - French school - Switzerland
by Stephen Barber

Romantic Period

Around the time he was working on *Euryanthe*, Weber also worked on another opera, to be called *Die drei Pintos*. He left a number of drafts and sketches, some in code. After various abortive attempts to have it completed, the task was taken on by the young Gustav Mahler, who deciphered the code, realized the sketches and wrote several numbers of his own to complete the opera, using Weber's themes. Although Mahler was a professional opera-house conductor, he never composed an opera of his own, so this has an interest of its own. It has been recorded with a starry cast by Gary Bertini (RCA) and also by Paolo Arrivabeni (Naxos).

Schumann's orchestration, at any rate in his later symphonies, has often been criticized for excessive doublings and heaviness. Many conductors prefer the original to the revised version of the fourth symphony for this reason. Some conductors of the symphonies, such as George Szell and Daniel Barenboim, adjust the dynamics and occasionally lighten the texture without anyone objecting. These changes are similar to those mentioned for Beethoven's symphonies. Mahler was particularly proud of his adjustments to Schumann's scoring, to the point of wanting his scores printed. Only some of them affect the orchestration; many are adjustments of dynamics. Carlo Maria Giulini recorded the third symphony, the *Rhenish*, in Mahler's version (EMI and DG). The whole cycle in Mahler's versions has been recorded by Aldo Ceccato (BIS) and Riccardo Chailly (Decca).

Shostakovich reorchestrated Schumann's cello concerto, also replacing the cello with the violin as the solo instrument. This has been recorded by Gidon Kremer (DG) and Alexander Ivashkin (Chandos).

Liszt was not only enormously prolific, he was also a compulsive reviser, so many of his works exist in more than one version. He was a good judge of his work, and the final versions are generally the best, but the earlier versions can have an interest of their own. Whether they count as rediscoveries, completions or reconstructions depends on the amount of editorial work involved. For the piano music, Leslie Howard's complete survey provides nearly every version of every work, and the booklets accompanying the series are a mine of information about revisions and reconstructions. These are all available online (Hyperion). The rival series from different hands on Naxos is also comprehensive. I can therefore be very selective.

The earlier versions of the *Paganini* and *Transcendental Studies* and the *Années de pèlerinage* are fairly well known and occasionally recorded. Not so the first cycle of *Harmonies poétiques et religieuses*, which Howard has identified, deciphered and recorded (split between CDA66421/2 and CDA67187).

Of the four *Mephisto Waltzes*, the first exists in several versions: for orchestra, piano duet and solo piano. The first two, but not the third, have two alternative endings. The louder one is the one usually played, but the softer one is the more poetic. Liszt did not provide this alternative ending in his solo piano version. Howard has done so; it has been published (Edition Peters) but is not included in his Hyperion series. (Busoni's transcription from the orchestral version is occasionally recorded, for example by Holger Groschop (Capriccio).) Liszt's piano version of its companion piece, *Der nächtliche Zug*, was long attributed to a pupil and forgotten. Howard rescued it and included it among his recordings (CDA67015). The second *Mephisto Waltz* also exists in both orchestral and piano versions. The third is a solo piano work only, but Gordon Jacob orchestrated it for the ballet *Apparitions*,

conducted by Barry Wordsworth (Dutton). The fourth is also only a solo piano work; Liszt left it unfinished, and this is how it is usually recorded, but Howard completed it for his Liszt series (CDA66201). It has not yet been orchestrated. (An orchestral set of all four, with *Der nächtliche Zug* as well, would be very welcome.)

But perhaps the star exhibit in reconstructing Liszt is the unfinished opera *Sardanapolo*, a mature work of which the composer drafted the first act. It was only in 2017 that David Trippett edited the manuscript and made a performing version. It has now been recorded by Kirill Karabits (Audite) and proves to be very much in the spirit of Verdi.

Berlioz wrote his first opera, *Benvenuto Cellini*, for the Paris opera, but even before the ill-fated premiere, he ran into trouble. The first version, known now as Paris 1, had to be cut and altered, both because of its difficulty and to please the censors. The version which was actually performed is known as Paris 2. This was a failure, and the opera was not revived until Liszt presented it at Weimar. For this, Berlioz made further cuts and some revisions. This became, by default, the standard version, until the Paris score was examined and published. In modern times all three versions have been recorded: Paris 1 (with some later additions) by John Nelson (Virgin Classics), Paris 2 by Colin Davis twice (Philips and LSO Live), and Weimar by Roger Norrington (Hänssler Classic).

His masterpiece, *Les Troyens*, also ran into trouble and was not performed complete until modern times. Happily, there are now several recordings. However, in the original version Berlioz wrote a scene in which the Greek spy Sinon gives Priam and the Trojans a lying account of the purpose of the wooden horse. In the hope of a production, Berlioz tore this out of the score, leaving only the opening. However, it had already been included in the vocal score, and so Hugh Macdonald was able to reconstruct the orchestration. As it was part of the original conception, in my view it should be included. However, the Charles Dutoit recording (Decca) is, so far, the only one to do so. The John Eliot Gardiner recording on DVD (Opus Arte) is the only one to include the saxhorns Berlioz scored for, and not replace them with modern instruments.

Italian opera is not my field, but there are two works I must mention. First is Verdi's *Don Carlos*. This was subjected to extensive cuts and revisions, starting before the first performance in Paris in 1867. The main distinction is between the revised and shorter 1884 version in four acts (the Milan version) and the longer 1886 version in five acts (the Modena version). Then there is the issue of whether to perform the work in the original French or in Italian translation, which Verdi sanctioned. Andrew Porter was the first to examine the score in Paris and to restore parts that had never been performed. The recording by John Matheson (Opera Rara) was the first to include his discoveries; the first absolutely complete stage production in French was conducted by Bertrand de Billy (Orfeo DVD). Otherwise, I refer readers to the comprehensive surveys by Ralph Moore [here](#) and Mark Pullinger [here](#). Both agree that the best choice is the 1961 Modena version in Italian by Gabriele Santini (DG).

The other Italian opera is Puccini's *Turandot*, his last work and left unfinished at his death, though he left sketches for the final scene. Franco Alfano completed it in a version known as Alfano 1, but considerably revised his completion, Alfano 2, and this is what is usually performed, though with a cut. There is a studio recording of Alfano 1 on a recital disc, *Opera Finales*, by Josephine Barstow conducted by John Mauceri (Decca) and a live one as a bonus to Alfano's *Risurrezione* under Elio Compagni (SRO). More recently the composer Luciano Berio made a new completion which some prefer; this has been recorded on DVD by Riccardo Chailly (Decca) and Valery's Gergiev (TDK); you can get Berio's completion on CD by itself in *Puccini discoveries* conducted by Chailly (Decca).

Wagner repeatedly revised *Der fliegende Holländer* without ever being finally satisfied. He originally imagined it in one long continuous act, but he later cut it, rather roughly, into three. And he revised the music of the ending, which in the original is rather trite, in his maturest style, giving us the 'redemption' ending which is nowadays usually used; he first used this ending in the revised overture. The consensus view is for the one act structure and the redemption ending, and most recordings, such as those by Georg Solti (Decca) and Giuseppe Sinopoli (DG) follow this. There is a recording of the original 1843 version by Marcd Minkowski (Naïve). Wolfgang Sawallisch (Philips) and Andris Nelsons (Royal Concertgebouw Orchestra) recorded the three-act version, Sawallisch using the original ending.

Tannhäuser also has a complicated history. The original version of 1843 was several times revised before the 1847 Dresden version, which became standard and was widely performed. The greatly revised Paris version of 1860 included a new Bacchanale in the Venusberg scene and sundry other changes. This version was finalized in 1867. Of modern recordings, Bernard Haitink (EMI) provides the final Dresden version, Georg Solti (Decca) the Paris version, and Wolfgang Sawallisch (Philips) and Daniel Barenboim (Teldec) each make a conflation of the two.

Tristan und Isolde brings a different set of issues. The *Prelude*, as Wagner wrote it, runs straight into the first act and has no ending of its own. In order to perform it in concert, the conductor Hans von Bülow, encouraged by Wagner, wrote a short conclusion to it. Wagner was dissatisfied by this and later composed his own concert ending, drawing on the closing music of the opera, which had not yet been composed when von Bülow made his ending. This then is a completion by the original composer. This concert ending is curiously little known; the score was hard to find (it is now published by W. W. Norton) and few conductors play it. Fortunately, there is a fine version by Adrian Boult (HMV 7 67645 2). Wagner also devised a concert ending, along similar lines, for the love duet from the second Act as a separate number. This was long lost but finally surfaced in the 1950s. The first recording was by Antonio Pappano with Plácido Domingo and Deborah Voigt (EMI). The popular custom of linking the *Prelude* with the *Liebtestod*, i.e. the closing scene without the vocal part, was also Wagner's idea. The *Liebtestod* is also sometimes performed on its own, with a singer. It really needs a concert beginning. In his piano transcription Liszt provided one, using music from the second Act. Tovey suggested using this in the orchestral version, but I am not aware of anyone having done so. The *Wesendonck Lieder*, which have links with *Tristan*, were written by Wagner for voice and piano. He orchestrated one (*Träume*) himself; Felix Mottl orchestrated the others, so completing the set in an orchestral version. Mottl's version is the standard one, frequently recorded; I can recommend Julia Varady (Orfeo) and Janet Baker (EMI). Of others, Henze's chamber orchestration has been well received; it has been recorded by Marjana Lipovsek with Wolfgang Sawallisch (EMI) and by Jard van Nes with Richard Hickox (Chandos).

Brahms originally wrote his piano quintet Op. 34 as a string quintet with two cellos. He then transcribed it for two pianos, and destroyed the original. He then transcribed it again for piano quintet but this time he did not destroy the two piano version. The original quintet version has been reconstructed by Anssi Karttunen and recorded by the augmented Zebra Trio (Toccata Classics). There are also numerous transcriptions of Brahms's works for different forces, such as the orchestration by Schoenberg of the G minor piano quartet Op. 25 (several versions including Christoph Eschenbach (RCA) and Simon Rattle (EMI)), by Kenneth Woods of the A major one Op. 26 (Nimbus), by Berio of the F minor Clarinet Sonata Op. 120 No. 1 conducted by Riccardo Chailly (Decca), of the *Four Serious Songs* Op. 121 by both Erich Leinsdorf (RCA) and Detlev Glanert (Ondine), a surprisingly effective one by the pianist Dejan Lazić of the violin concerto Op. 77 as a piano concerto (Channel Classics), by Edmund

Rubbra of the Handel Variations Op. 24 conducted by Neeme Järvi (Chandos) and versions of the *Hungarian Dances* for various combinations by Brahms himself and others.

Bruckner was an inveterate reviser of his own works and most Bruckner-lovers – I am one of them – have strong views about which versions they prefer. The situation is complicated by different approaches to editing. Robert Haas, who edited most of the symphonies during the 1930s and 1940s, aimed to free Bruckner's scores from the suggestions of conductors, which he considered were imposed on the composer, and to produce an ideal version of each work. In the second and eighth symphonies this involved conflating different versions, and also, in the case of the eighth, opening cuts and drawing on a sketch. After the war he was removed, because of his Nazi sympathies, and these also cast a cloud over his editorial work. Leopold Nowak made new editions, each based on the actual scores and instructions Bruckner had left, and abandoning the idea of ideal versions. Nevertheless, many conductors and Bruckner-lovers prefer the Haas scores, particularly in the eighth symphony; these include Herbert von Karajan, Bernard Haitink and Günter Wand. For the different versions of the symphonies in general see [here](#) and [here](#); for the eighth symphony specifically see [here](#). An even more complex case is the third symphony, which exists in at least four main versions; see [here](#). William Carragan is about to publish a book detailing all the versions of all the symphonies. Recordings should state, but often don't, which edition they are using. New editions of Bruckner's works are in hand and ideas change; for example, Carragan has made new editions of the first three symphonies, recorded by Gerd Schaller (Profil 12022), and the 1888 version of the fourth symphony, initially rejected by both Haas and Nowak, has been rehabilitated by Benjamin Korstvedt and recorded by Osmo Vänska (BIS) and also see [here](#). Gerd Schaller is in the process of recording all the symphonies in all the principal versions in his Bruckner 2024 programme. I would not be surprised if, in the next turn of the wheel, the idea of constructing ideal versions did not return.

The case of Bruckner's ninth symphony is rather different. At the time of his death he had completed the first three movements, whose text is, for Bruckner, relatively stable. For the finale he left a series of sketches, though there are gaps because some sheets were taken away as souvenirs. In any case they did not extend to the coda. He certainly planned to complete the symphony and not leave it as a torso. There have now been several completions of the finale. Three are of particular importance. All are based closely on Bruckner's surviving sketches. William Carragan was the first, and his completion has been revised four times. His latest version was recorded by Gerd Schaller (Profil Medien PH11028 – do not confuse this with Schaller's own completion). Next came a group of four people, starting with Nicola Samale and Giuseppe Mazzuca, whose work was later taken over by John A. Phillips and Benjamin-Gunnar Cohrs. This is generally referred to as the SPCM version. It has also been revised several times, with the final revision recorded by Simon Rattle (Warner). Then there is the conductor Gerd Schaller, who, after recording Carragan's completion made his own, and has also revised his work. There are also others and most of them have been recorded, though sometimes by obscure orchestras and conductors. Details are available [here](#). There is a consideration and ranking of all the available completions [here](#). So far, I have been most convinced by Schaller's revised version (Profil Medien PH18030). The scores of that and of the final SPCM version have been published.

Bruckner's string quintet, his only mature chamber work, is beautiful but occasionally seems to call for orchestral forces. The Adagio was transcribed by Oeser for string orchestra, and has occasionally been recorded, for example by Herbert Blomstedt (Decca) and Vladimir Ashkenazy (Ondine). Transcriptions of the whole work for string orchestra have been made by Hans Stadlmair, conducted by Ruben Gazarian (Bayer), and by Michael Erxleben (Cugate). Gerd Schaller transcribed it for full orchestra, i.e.

with wind and brass as well as strings, and included both the original Scherzo and the Intermezzo which replaced it in the quintet version (Profil).

With Mahler there are issues at the opposite ends of his life. The first version of his early cantata *Das klagende Lied* was completed in 1880, and was in three parts: *Waldmärchen*, *Der Spielmann* and *Hochzeitsstück*. Mahler revised it in 1893 and again in 1899. In this final version he discarded the first part, reduced the number of solo singers and reduced the size of the off-stage band. This two-part version was the one regularly performed before the original score came to light in 1969. Conductors now sometimes play only the revised version (e.g. Bernard Haitink, Pierre Boulez on DG) and sometimes they prefix the first part to the revised second and third parts (e.g. Pierre Boulez on Sony, Simon Rattle, Riccardo Chailly and Cornelius Meister). The first recording of the complete 1880 original version is by Kent Nagano (Erato).

Mahler's orchestral songs were originally written with piano accompaniment before he orchestrated them. This has suggested the idea of orchestrating some of his other songs. The versions by Luciano Berio have been recorded by Thomas Hampson (Teldec), Andreas Schmidt (RCA) and Matthias Goerne (Harmonia Mundi). Those by Harold Byrns have been recorded by Bernd Weikl (DG).

Mahler's first symphony was first performed in 1889 in a version which has survived only in part. For the second version, of 1893, he equipped it with a title, *Titan*, and a programme. Both of these versions included an extra movement, *Blumine*, as the second movement. For the final version, of 1896, Mahler deleted the title, the programme and *Blumine*, and revised the orchestration of the rest. *Blumine* was lost for many years and only reappeared in 1968. Some conductors add *Blumine* to recordings of the final version, either as an extra (so Hannu Lintu on Ondine), or as a conflated version with *Blumine* in its original place (so Vladimir Jurowski on LPO). Recordings of the complete 1893 version include Jan Willem de Vriend (Challenge Classics) and Thomas Hengelbrock (Sony); more recently, François-Xavier Roth (Harmonia Mundi) has recorded 1893 on period instruments.

Before we reach Mahler's final symphony there are two issues concerning the sixth symphony. There seems no certainty about the correct order of the middle two movements as it seems that Mahler changed his mind twice. My preference is Scherzo-Andante. Then there is the issue of the hammerblows in the finale. Mahler originally wrote three of these, but in revision deleted the third. Some people think he did this for superstitious rather than musical reasons and would like it restored, preferably along with its surrounding orchestration; I am one of them. Not many conductors do this: those who do include Leonard Bernstein (both Sony and DG), Charles Mackerras (BBC Music Magazine MM251), Jukka-Pekka Saraste (Simax) and Benjamin Zander (three versions: Carlton Classics, Telarc and Brattle Media).

Mahler completed a sketch of his tenth symphony but did not live to complete the orchestration or to revise the work as was his custom. Even the orchestration of the first movement is not as full he would normally have left it. Ernst Krenek made the first performing score of the first and third movements, with the help of Franz Schalk and Zemlinsky, and these were occasionally performed on their own. It is now well known how Deryck Cooke came to make what he always called a performing version of the sketch, and not a completion of the symphony, though for many people this is a distinction without a difference. Cooke's own account of how he did his work is available (Testament) and there are at least ten recordings, among which Simon Rattle's second, with the Berlin Philharmonic (Warner), is probably the best known. The Cooke version is the most widely performed but there are several others; a chart of all of them and their recordings is available [here](#). Of these I have heard the Rudolf Barshai version

(Brilliant Classics), more a completion of the symphony than, as with Cooke, a performing version of the sketch, but for me a valid alternative to Cooke. The success of the Cooke version led to completions of other unfinished symphonies, notably the Bruckner ninth, discussed above, and the Elgar third and Moeran second, for which see below.

French school

I have already considered Berlioz. Of the Franck school the first to be considered is Ernest Chausson. When he died in a bicycle accident he left his string quartet unfinished, having completed two movements and most of a scherzo. As there was no material for a finale, Vincent d'Indy completed the scherzo, bringing the work to an end in its home key. There are several recordings, including the Doric quartet (Chandos), the Quatuor Via Nova (Apex) and the Chilingirian quartet (Hyperion).

Charles Bordes was a Franck disciple who never completed his intended *magnum opus*, an opera to be called *Les Trois Vagues*. He orchestrated the first two acts but not the third and had not composed the last scene. D'Indy and others were consulted and declared that the work could not be completed. However, the contemporary composer Nicholas Bacri thinks otherwise and has been working on a completion, which we must hope will be recorded when it is performed.

Albéric Magnard was killed defending his home at the beginning of the first World War. His house was set on fire and several works were lost. The vocal score of his last opera *Guercoeur* survived but most of the orchestral score was destroyed. It was reconstructed by Guy Ropartz and has been recorded by Michel Plasson (EMI).

Another Franck disciple who died prematurely was Guillaume Lekeu, who died young, leaving a number of unfinished works. The cello sonata and the piano quartet were completed by d'Indy. The cello sonata is a long work in four movements; there are recordings by Guilhon-Herbert and Meunier (Saphir), Dewes and Devos (Ricercar) and Wallfisch and York (Cello Classics). Of the piano quartet Lekeu left the first movement and most of the second, which d'Indy finished. He left no material for the projected third and final movement. There are recordings by the enlarged Hochelaga Trio (Atma), the enlarged Spiller Trio (Arts), the Frith piano quartet (Nimbus) and Domus (Ricercar).

Chabrier only managed to complete one act of his last opera *Briséis*. Of the rest he left only sketches, and even d'Indy could make nothing of them. The one complete act has been recorded by Jean-Yves Ossonce (Hyperion).

Fauré's *Requiem* developed slowly over a long period. The first performance of parts of it was in 1888 and the first complete liturgical performance in 1889. There is a reconstruction of this by Marc Rigaudière, recorded by Stephen Cleobury (King's College Cambridge). By 1893 Fauré had added two further sections and slightly enlarged the orchestra to a chamber ensemble. However, he did not publish this and he enlarged the orchestra again for the 1901 published version, in which, however, his pupil Jean Roger-Ducasse may have had a hand; it also has many misprints. In recent years scholars have worked on reconstructing the 1893 version, which does not survive as such, as Fauré added the additional parts to his autograph score. John Rutter was the first to make and record a version of the 1893 score (Collegium). However, he did not have access to the surviving set of the 1893 orchestral parts. These were drawn on by Jean-Michel Nectoux and Roger Delage for what is now the standard score of this version, published in 1994. The first recording of it was by Philippe Herreweghe (Harmonia Mundi HMG 501292). (This was made before the score was published, which has some revisions.) John Eliot Gardiner recorded the published edition (Philips). There are many recordings of the 1901 version,

including such classics as the first King's College Cambridge one, under David Willcocks (EMI), but the score needed tidying up, which was done first by Roger Fiske in 1979 and then by Nectoux again, this time with Reiner Zimmerman, in a score published in 2001. Herreweghe again was the first to record this edition (Harmonia Mundi HMC901771).

Debussy left almost as many uncompleted works as Schubert, including no fewer than three operas. When he had won the *Prix de Rome* he worked on a cantata for orchestra with wordless chorus, *Printemps*, but sent back to Paris only a vocal score with piano duet saying that the full score had been lost in a fire. He later allowed Henri Büsser to make an orchestral arrangement and this is widely recorded. However, the conductor Emil de Cou has reconstructed the original, reinstating the chorus and opening the cuts Büsser had made. This has been recorded by him (Arabesque) and is well worth hearing. Another early work was the opera *Rodrigue et Chimène*; three of the projected four acts exist in short score or vocal score; the last act is missing. The surviving score was completed by Richard Langham Smith and orchestrated by Edison Denisov; it has been recorded by Kent Nagano (Erato). A more recent version by Robert Orledge is due to be recorded shortly.

There is an important textual detail in *La Mer* worth dwelling on. As originally composed, it included some brass fanfares in the last movement, which Debussy deleted in revision. Modern scores do not include them, but you can find them [here](#). Many conductors reinstate them, including Herbert von Karajan (DG), Bernard Haitink (Philips), Colin Davis (Philips) and Charles Dutoit (Decca), and the texture certainly seems thin without them.

Debussy worked off and on over a number of years on two one-act operas, *Le Diable dans le Beffroi* and *La Chute de la Maison Usher*. He left a few pages of music for the first and rather more for the second. Juan-Allende Blin reconstructed part of *Usher*, and this was recorded by Georges Prêtre (EMI). More recently Orledge has reconstructed both operas, which have been recorded with great success by Christoph-Mathias Mueller (Pan Classics). I suspect these are more pastiche composition than reconstruction, but they are nevertheless very convincing.

Debussy's *Trois chansons de Bilitis* for voice and piano were his first engagement with this work by Pierre Louÿs. He then wrote *Les chansons de Bilitis*, an entirely separate stage work in twelve numbers for reciter and small ensemble, including a celesta. He did not publish this version and the celesta part was lost. It was first reconstructed by Pierre Boulez, unpublished, and then by Arthur Hoeree, which has been published and is now standard. It has been recorded by Catherine Deneuve and Ensemble Wien-Berlin (DG) and by Delphine Seyrig and the Nash Ensemble (Erato). There is another edition by Rudolf Escher and Dirk Jacob Hamoen. Debussy later adapted six movements first for piano four hands, and later for solo piano, and published them as *Six épigraphes antiques*.

At the end of his life Debussy planned a series of six sonatas. He completed only the first three: for violin and piano, cello and piano, and flute, viola and harp. The others would have been for oboe, harpsichord and horn, for piano, clarinet, bassoon and trumpet, and for a mixed ensemble. Some years ago, the Lincoln Center in New York had the imaginative idea of commissioning three contemporary composers to write the three missing sonatas, though they were not bound to Debussy's idiom. The composers they chose were Steven Stucky, Kaija Saariaho (whose work is for piano trio rather than the projected mixed ensemble) and Marc-André Dalbavie. The complete set of six was recorded (download from DG Concerts, available on CD from Lincoln Center). The Australian composer Lyle Chan and Orledge have each also written three sonatas with Debussy's proposed instrumentation. Chan's set is said to be forthcoming from ABC Classics; you can hear his No. 6 [here](#).

In his later years Debussy used others to help orchestrate his works. André Caplet worked on *Le Martyre de de Saint Sébastien*, and Charles Koechlin on *Khamma*; I have already mentioned Büsser's version of *Printemps*, and he also orchestrated the *Petite Suite*. From this it is a short step to other orchestrations, some by famous names. These include Ravel's of the *Danse (Tarantelle styriennne)* and the *Sarabande* from *Pour le Piano*, Ernest Ansermet's *Six épigraphes antiques*, Gustave Cloz and André Caplet's *Suite Bergamasque*, Percy Grainger's *Pagodes* and Leopold Stokowski's *Clair de lune, Soirée en Grenade* and *Cathédrale engloutie*.

There are several collections of these, with overlapping contents, from de Cou (Arabesque), Yoav Talmi (Atma), Zoltán Kocsis (Hungaroton, with both Debussy and Ravel) and two from Jun Märkl (Naxos). The Grainger *Pagodes* come from Simon Rattle (EMI). More recent orchestrations are the Colin Matthews *Préludes* from Mark Elder (Hallé), the John Adams Baudelaire songs from Yan Pascal Tortelier (Warner), the Brett Dean *Ariettes oubliées* from Robin Ticciati (Linn). and the Robin Holloway two-piano suite *En blanc et noir* from Märkl.

There are other orchestrations and Orledge in particular has devoted a good deal of time to reconstructing, reimagining and orchestrating many works which Debussy left unfinished. Some of his versions have yet to be recorded. There is a list of them [here](#).

Ravel wrote several works first for piano and then orchestrated them or parts of them himself. Of the five movement piano suite *Miroirs*, he orchestrated only the third, *Une barque sur l'océan*, and the fourth, *Alborada del gracioso*. Of the others, some have orchestrated individual pieces; these include Percy Grainger's remarkable version of *La Vallée des cloches*, recorded by Simon Rattle (EMI). So far as I know, only Michael Round has orchestrated all three of the pieces Ravel did not, thereby completing the suite in an orchestral version. This has been recorded by Vladimir Ashkenazy (Exton). The situation with *Le tombeau de Couperin* is similar: of the six movements of the piano version, Ravel orchestrated four, omitting the Fugue and the Toccata. Several composers have orchestrated the two missing movements to complete the suite; recordings include Ashkenazy again (Exton) and Zoltán Kocsis on the disc with Debussy (Hungaroton). Of other orchestral transcriptions I must at least mention that by Marius Constant of *Gaspard de la nuit*, recorded by Christoph Eschenbach (Ondine), and that of the piano trio by Yan Pascal Tortelier (Chandos).

Lili Boulanger would have been a great composer had she lived longer, and, even given her early death, what she achieved was pretty remarkable. She worked on an opera based on a play by Maeterlinck, *La Princesse Maleine*, which she was not able to complete. What happened to her drafts is unclear, but this might be a candidate for completion, if enough remains.

On arriving in the USA Varèse wrote *Amérique*, for very large orchestra. However, the standard version was preceded by an earlier and longer one for even larger orchestra. This has been edited by the Varèse specialist Chou Wen-chung and recorded by Riccardo Chailly, in his useful set of Varèse's (nearly) complete works (Decca). This set also includes Antony Beaumont's orchestral version of Varèse's only surviving early song and Chou's reconstructions of *Tuning Up, Dance for Burgess* and *Nocturnal*, Varèse's last work. Of his projected choral work *Espace*, he completed only an *Étude*. Chou at first thought Varèse had made contradictory revisions to this which made it unperformable, but more recently changed his mind. His reconstruction has not yet been commercially recorded but you can hear it [here](#).

The score of Messiaen's early *Hymne au Saint Sacrement* was lost during the war, and he reconstructed it from memory in 1947. The extant score probably benefits from the greater mastery he had achieved in the intervening years and deserves to be better known.

At his death Messiaen left a few unfinished works. The largest of these was the quadruple concerto for flute, oboe, cello and piano, *Concert à Quatre*. His widow Yvonne Loriod, assisted by Heinz Holliger and George Benjamin, orchestrated part of the first movement and all of the last, and also supplied a cadenza. It has been recorded by Myung-Whun Chung (DG). Peter Hill unearthed, completed and recorded a piano work, *La Fauvette passerinette*, possibly intended for a projected second *Catalogue d'oiseaux* (Delphian). There is also a valuable disc of fugitive and unpublished works, *Inédits*, including four short pieces for Ondes Martenot and piano assembled by Yvonne Loriod (Jade).

Boulez had the inconvenient habit of withdrawing or partially withdrawing some works and then sometimes issuing new versions. Thanks to recording, some of the withdrawn works can still be heard, such as the early *Polyphonie X* and *Poésie pour Pouvoir* (Col Legno). His largest work, *Pli selon Pli*, exists in two main versions; the composer's first two recordings are of the first version (Sony and Erato), his third, of the final version (DG). It remains to be seen whether his estate will release early versions of works he revised, or works he completed but withdrew, such as the other movements of the third piano sonata, of which he only approved one movement for publication.

Switzerland

The rise in interest in Frank Martin, at least on record, has led to even his most fugitive works being recorded. *Ein Totentanz zu Basel im Jahre 1943* was an occasional work which has only been performed twice. Bastiaan Blomhert put the score into order and recorded it complete (CPO). He also made a suite from it. This has been recorded by Matthew Westgate (MSR Classics), together with the chamber version of Martin's *Concerto pour les instruments à vent et le piano*, which is an early work, not to be confused with the well known *Concerto pour sept instruments à vent, timbales, batterie et orchestre à cordes*. Thierry Fischer's collection of flute works includes Ernest Ansermet's orchestration of the *Ballade* for flute, which precedes Martin's own, the orchestration by Viktor Desarzens of the *Sonata da chiesa* and Martin's own flute version of the *Ballade* for saxophone (Musiques Suisses).